

氏 名 坂 知尋

学位(専攻分野) 博士(学術)

学位記番号 総研大甲第 2054 号

学位授与の日付 平成 31年 3 月 22日

学位授与の要件 文化科学研究科 国際日本研究専攻
学位規則第6条第1項該当

学位論文題目 From Old Hag in Hell to Guide to the Pure Land:
An Examination of the Representation of Datsueba in
Literature and Visual Imagery Together with Rituals and
Worship Practices

論文審査委員 主 査 准教授 クレインス フレデリック
教授 細川 周平
教授 フィスター パトリシア ジーン
教授 佐藤 弘夫
東北大学大学院 文学研究科
教授 Sherry FOWLER
University of Kansas 美術史学部

博士論文の要旨

氏 名 坂 知 尋

論文題目 From Old Hag in Hell to Guide to the Pure Land: An Examination of the Representation of Datsueba in Literature and Visual Imagery Together with Rituals and Worship Practices

Datsueba 奪衣婆, usually represented as an old woman with long, straggly hair and sagging breasts, figures prominently in popular conceptions of Buddhist hell in Japan. She is said to take off the clothes or skin of the deceased on the bank of the Sanzu River (Sanzu no kawa 三途の川; lit. River of Three Crossings or River of Three Lower Rebirths) which they are supposed to cross after death. This river metaphysically flows through *chūu* 中有 or *chūin* 中陰 (Sk. *Antara-bhava*, T. *bardo*), the intermediate state between death and rebirth. Although the general concept of a transitional state is recognized in Buddhist traditions in Tibet, China, and Japan, it has developed unique features in each country. While the intermediate state is described as a psychological experience in the Tibetan scripture *Bardo Thodol* (Tibetan Book of the Dead), the *Foshuo yuxiu shiwang shengqijing* 仏説預修十王生七經 (Jp. *Bussetsu yoshū jūō shōshichi kyō*; hereafter referred to as the *Scripture on the Ten Kings*) composed in China describes the state as a bureaucratic judicial process administrated by the Ten Kings of Hell. The latter perception was adopted in Japan, but as it absorbed indigenous elements it was further developed and reinterpreted. Technically the intermediate state is not yet “hell”, yet it is often incorporated into the landscape of hell in both China and Japan due to its ghastly atmosphere in which deceased individuals are condemned for their past deeds and tortured. Datsueba may be unique to the Japanese imagination of this transitional stage, for she does not appear in Buddhist scriptures originating in other countries such as India, Tibet, and China.

References to Datsueba started appearing in scriptures and religious stories in eleventh-century Japan, but in these early texts, she does not seem to be a major character. However, over the centuries Datsueba came to assume more conspicuous roles as a deity marking the border with the otherworld, as a counterpart of the King of Hell Yama (Jp. Enma 閻魔), and as one who saves the condemned from hell. Not only did she play a significant role in rituals and practices related to death and salvation, but by the seventeenth century, Datsueba also came to be worshipped as a miraculous deity who grants various worldly benefits including safe childbirth and fertility. In this dissertation, I attempt to unravel and reveal the layers of her persona

while highlighting her roles in developments of hell imagery as well as in local beliefs in Japan. Since previous studies of Datsueba have focused primarily on certain aspects of her in a limited context, I seek to achieve an all-inclusive understanding of this figure. My research method involves looking at Datsueba from multiple angles, investigating a wide range of materials such as texts, paintings and woodblock prints, sculptures, and veneration practices.

This dissertation consists of five main chapters along with an Introduction and Conclusion. Chapter 1 surveys the development of hell in Buddhist Asia, providing the critical background information for my research topic. The first half of the chapter discusses the basic concept of hell in Buddhism, referring to various descriptions of hell in scriptures and to surviving examples of early pictorial representations of hell in India and Central Asia. The second half of the chapter examines Chinese adaptations of hell imagery, focusing particularly on belief in the Ten Kings of Hell embodied in the *Scripture on the Ten Kings*. I investigate how Daoist and folk ideas as well as the Confucian notion of filial piety came to be incorporated into this scripture, and compare the landscape of hell depicted in the Japanese version of the Ten Kings scripture (*Jizō jūō kyō* 地藏十王經) with that of the tenth century *Shi wang jing tu juan* 十王經圖卷 (Illustrated Scripture on the Ten Kings) discovered at Dunhuang. Although Datsueba herself does not appear in the *Scripture on the Ten Kings*, the text includes many elements related to her, such as the Nai he River attended by a pair of guardians. Moreover, among visual narratives in the Illustrated Scripture on the Ten Kings, different ways of crossing the river and a tree hung with clothes recall the image of Datsueba recounted in the *Jizō jūō kyō*.

In addition, I examine a Daoist version of the Ten Kings scripture (*Yuli baochao* 玉歷寶鈔), paying specific attention to the elderly female deity Meng po 孟婆 who erases memories of the deceased in order to prepare them for the next life. Considering Datsueba's close association with hell and death, I also look closely at goddesses in Hinduism and Buddhism who are related to the underworld: King of Hell Yama's twin sister Yami, who governs the abode of the female dead in Indian mythology; the *dakini* clan who inhabit burial grounds and devour dead bodies; and the cannibal *yaksa* Hariti, who purportedly gave birth to five hundred children and later converted to Buddhism. All of these female deities are associated with hell or death as well as with fertility and reproduction. They embody the dual aspects of creation and destruction since both are indispensable to the worldview based on the idea of *samsara*. I argue that Datsueba's later association with reproduction and childrearing may be derived from the idea that creation and destruction, or birth and death, represent two sides of the same coin. However, I also point out that at least in the scriptures, Datsueba herself does not take or restore life; rather, she prepares the deceased for a transition to the next life. In this sense, Meng po in the Daoist belief in

the Ten Kings plays a role similar to Datsueba.

Chapter 2 offers a critical review of diverse representations and roles of Datsueba and Datsueba-like figures in Japanese religious texts and popular stories. I concentrate on three groups of texts: the story of Renshū in the *Hokke genki* and related literature, the *Jizō jūō kyō* scripture and commentaries, and selected *otogizōshi* stories. In analyzing these texts, I focus particularly on the following issues: What is the old woman by the river referred to as? Where and how does she reside? Why does she take the clothes of the sinners? In what context is she depicted in the story? How does the representation of the old hag in literary works correspond to the representations in paintings? Through investigating these literary works, I show that even though there is some disparity in the way in which Datsueba is characterized and described, one can still define essential, shared features.

Chapter 3 concentrates on the development of Japanese hell imagery as well as visual representations of Datsueba. Surviving examples suggest that images of her started appearing in the landscape of hell around the thirteenth century, one or two centuries after her emergence in written texts. The first section briefly surveys examples of hell imagery datable to the Nara and Heian periods. In particular, I examine the physical characteristics of female hell guards appearing in the *Jigoku zōshi* 地獄草子, which anticipate some ogre-like Datsueba images included in later hell paintings. The second section focuses on paintings based on the *Ōjōyōshū* 往生要集 and the *Jizō jūō kyō*, since they are generally regarded as the most influential texts for the development of Japanese hell imagery. The third section analyzes Datsueba images appearing in *Rokudō jūō zu* 六道十王図 (Paintings of the Six Realms and the Ten Kings). Although the inclusion of Datsueba can be explained by the popularity of the *Jizō jūō kyō*, I argue that her manner of representation does not always correspond to the scriptural narrative; she is not necessarily associated with her male counterpart Ken'e-ō or the second of the Ten Kings. Instead, Datsueba is often positioned in liminal spaces and marks the border between distinct realms. The last section of this chapter looks into some unique representations of Datsueba and explores the reasons and background underlying them. As indicated in Edo period iconographic texts such as the *Butsuzō zui* 仏像図彙, she is generally depicted as a terrifying female ogre. However, there are some cases where she is not illustrated in such a manner. I discuss two exceptional cases in which the visual representation of Datsueba was intentionally modified: the young noblewoman-like Datsueba image included in the *Shidoji engi-e* 志度寺縁起絵 (Illustrated Origin Story of Shidoji) and the humorously deified Datsueba images by Utagawa Kuniyoshi appearing in late Edo period woodblock prints.

Chapter 4 explores the way in which Datsueba is represented in pilgrimage mandalas (*sankei mandara* 参詣曼荼羅) depicting three different religious sites: the

Ise Shrines, Zenkōji, and the Tateyama Mountains. Some of these mandalas show an image of Datsueba inside an Uba Hall that is assumed to have existed in the precincts; others seem to depict her as part of extended narrative stories. The stories and messages conveyed by these mandalas are distinct from one another, and my investigation sheds light on several developments of Datsueba, such as her border-marking function and her role in indicating salvation. In so doing, I attempt to demonstrate how she was reinterpreted within different religious traditions and came to take on other connotations. One new development I highlight is the expansion of Datsueba's characteristic as a deity at the threshold.

Chapter 5 investigates beliefs connected with Datsueba sculptural images and explores the development of Datsueba devotional cults in the Edo period. I have selected several representative images from the numerous examples scattered across the country, and use them to elucidate three noteworthy aspects of Datsueba veneration. The first section discusses Datsueba's function as a border marker. While the previous chapter highlighted this role in the context of pilgrimage mandalas, here I address Uba Halls with enshrined images of Datsueba and their contribution to the conceptualization of actual religious space. The second section focuses on the significance of cloth. As demonstrated in her name "Datsueba" (Clothes-Snatching Old Hag) and visualizations of her holding a piece of cloth, cloth has been a symbolic attribute since her earliest appearance in religious texts narrating her signature role of taking clothes of newly deceased people. However, cloth used in rituals and devotional practices is not merely a reference to the clothes of the deceased; rather, it is often associated with the notion of salvation granted to worshippers. I investigate how meanings of cloth came to be reinterpreted while examining some devotional practices in which cloth plays an important role. The last section focuses on Datsueba's association with other Japanese female deities or historical figures. As pointed out by scholars of folk religion, the relationship between Datsueba and Ubagami is conspicuous in many Datsueba cults. Focusing on examples in Fukushima prefecture where Datsueba is widely worshipped, I look into how different divinities merged and came to be identified with one another through shared features. I will also examine one image whose original identity as Datsueba shifted to represent the Heian poetess Ono no Komachi, and consider how negative attitudes towards women in Japanese Buddhism possibly facilitated this transformation.

This dissertation argues that, despite her quasi-heterodox origins, Datsueba became an important and distinctive figure in the popular conception of hell. While she consistently appears as an old hag by the Sanzu River throughout the centuries, the conception and roles of Datsueba expanded when she appeared outside hell or was worshipped as an individual deity. The under-representation, and lack of detailed descriptions of Datsueba in authorized religious texts may have contributed to these

diverse developments, allowing worshippers to imagine and interpret her more freely. The dearth of detail also facilitated her associations with various sacred figures, leading her to be widely accepted by people from diverse religious affiliations as a deity who could help one navigate through the uncharted world of life and death.

Results of the doctoral thesis screening

博士論文審査結果

Name in Full 氏名 坂 知尋

論文題目 From Old Hag in Hell to Guide to the Pure Land:
An Examination of the Representation of Datsueba in Literature and Visual Imagery
Together with Rituals and Worship Practices

本論文は、三途の川のほとりで亡者の衣服をはぎ取る「奪衣婆」に対する認識と表象、宗教空間の中での機能、そして信仰形態がどのように成立し、変化していったかを解明することを課題としている。同課題を克服するために、申請者は奪衣婆について書かれている経典・伝承などの文字情報の他に地獄絵・曼荼羅などの図像的情報、信仰・儀式などの民俗学的情報を網羅的に調査し、その情報を、ジェンダーからの視点をも視野に入れながら、研究・分析するという学際的アプローチを取っている。

本論文は、本文 5 章と序論・結論から構成されている。序論において、国内外の先行研究について詳細な分析を行い、奪衣婆表象の多様性が認められていることに着目する。申請者は、そのような先行研究のこれまでの成果を踏まえて、多様性の成立過程および各時代・地域における変化をより包括的な研究方法を用いて解明することを目指している。

第 1 章「アジアにおける地獄の観念」で申請者は、日本における奪衣婆の概念の成立背景を解明するために、インドや中央アジア、中国の地獄文学や絵画における地獄の表象を調査している。その中で、『十王経』や『十王経図巻』において川や獄卒、衣服の懸けられた樹木などの奪衣婆を連想させる要素を多く同定している。また、道教に受容された十王信仰について検討した結果、生まれ変わりの移行過程に関わる孟婆との類似性を実証した点は特筆に値する。さらに、ヒンズー教や仏教における、ヤミやダキニ、鬼子母神など死に関わる女神の性格についても考察し、これらの女神は、江戸期における奪衣婆と同様に、死に関わっていると共に、出産にも関わっていることを解明している。以上のように、奪衣婆が通常日本独自のものと考えられてきたのに対して、本論文がインドや中国の影響の解明への糸口を提供したことは学界への重要な貢献の一つである。

第 2 章「宗教書や大衆文学に現れる奪衣婆の描写」で申請者は、中世の文献に登場する初期の奪衣婆の表象について解明するために、『法華験記』、『地蔵十王経』や御伽草子などにおける奪衣婆の呼称・現れる場所・役割・性格について詳細に調査分析を行った。その結果、老女・川・樹木・衣服は初期の奪衣婆を表現する上で共通の特徴であることが明らかにされた。

第3章「奪衣婆の視覚的表現」において、奪衣婆が絵画においてどのように描かれ、その表象がどのように発展していったかという課題に取り組むために申請者は、奪衣婆の図像が初出する『六道十王図』よりも前に遡り、まず初期の日本の地獄絵について調査し、『地獄草子』に登場する女の獄卒が後の奪衣婆と似た特徴を有していることを解明した。また、『六道十王図』に描かれる奪衣婆の象徴的な意味や多様な役割を詳細に分析し、その結果、共通の機能として、「異なる空間の境目を示す」という特徴を見出した。その中で、「『六道十王図』における奪衣婆の表象は必ずしも『地藏十王経』の描写とは一致しない」ことを指摘する。その上、江戸時代に入ると、奪衣婆の表象が定型化されることを論証しながらも、「志度寺縁起」や狂画のような特異な事例も存在することを指摘し、その理由について、その特異な表象においてほかの物語への連想など特殊な効果が意図された可能性があるという有力な仮説を立てている。

第4章「参詣曼荼羅における奪衣婆の表象」で申請者は、『伊勢参詣曼荼羅』・『善光寺参詣曼荼羅』・『立山曼荼羅』という三つの参詣曼荼羅における奪衣婆の表象について地獄絵と比較しながら分析している。その結果、参詣曼荼羅において、奪衣婆がより広義に現世と来世、ならびに聖と俗との間のランドマークとして機能し、信者が参拝した時の救済の象徴でもあったと指摘し、これまで奪衣婆を主に地獄絵の中で分析してきた先行研究を補完する新しい見解を導き出した。また、申請者は、その新見解に基づき、奪衣婆が境界の女神としての性格をもつようになり、多様化したと結論付けている。

以上の見解を踏まえて、申請者は第5章「奪衣婆を祀る：信仰と宗教実践」において、実際の宗教空間や宗教実践の中で奪衣婆がどのように解釈されていったのかを明らかにするために、江戸時代に遡る奪衣婆信仰の複数の事例を考察している。まず、山形県立石寺および愛知県熱田神宮で祀られる奪衣婆像を取り上げ、独創的考察の結果、どちらの事例においても奪衣婆が生と死、聖と俗を分けるランドマークとして機能していることを明らかにした。次に、儀式や宗教実践において、奪衣婆と関係の深い「布」が象徴的な役割を果たすことに注目し、布橋灌頂会やお召替え、さらに正受院の奪衣婆信仰に関わる針供養について考察を深めた。申請者はこのような儀式の利益は経典や仏教説話に見られないと指摘し、奪衣婆と布との関わりについての解釈が転じて生まれた認識であると結論付けた。最後に、奪衣婆が様々な神格と同一視されることについて検討し、特に安産の神、橋の守り神、修験道の境界の神として信仰され、奪衣婆とも同一視される福島県のおんば様信仰を事例として分析した。これらの事例を踏まえて、奪衣婆の多様な性格が成立したのは、「老女」をはじめとする類似性をもつ多様な女神と同一視されることによって、奪衣婆は「新しい」人格を獲得していき、出産や育児などの母性的な側面と結びつくようになったと申請者は結論付けている。

本論文の結論において、奪衣婆の多様性がなぜ生まれたのかという課題について、奪衣婆の初出の仏典においてごく限られた情報（老女・川・樹木・衣服）しか提供されていなかったからこそ、これらの限られた情報が様々に解釈され、

関連付けられ、奪衣婆の重層的で多面的な神格が形成されていったのであると申請者は論じている。

以上のように、本論文はこれまで断片的な研究しか存在していなかった奪衣婆について初めて包括的な見解を提示した。申請者は奪衣婆の成立起源の分析から開始し、日本における奪衣婆の役割に関する認識および表象について仏教教理から民間信仰へと横断的に分析を広げていき、一つの固定的なイメージに囚われない奪衣婆の多様性を明らかにした。なお、奪衣婆が日本独自の概念であるとしながらも、その起源の分析においてインドや中国思想との比較を行い、また、国内外の先行研究を同等に検討しているため、本論文は国際性にも富んでいる。最後に、奪衣婆が女性の否定的側面（不妊症、悪質な性質、汚れ）を体現しているという一部の先行研究に対して、申請者はジェンダー論の観点から検証を行い、奪衣婆信仰の多くにおいて否定的な姿勢は認められないことを実証した点も独創的である。

ただし、中世から江戸にかけて地獄・死者観がどのように変遷したのか、近代化が奪衣婆信仰にどのような影響を与えたか、そして孟婆との関連性を立証するために道教経典『玉歴宝鈔』など関連史料がいつ日本へ舶載されたのかという課題が未解決であるとの指摘が各審査委員から出された。しかし、これらの課題はいずれも、本論文への批判として出されたものではなく、今後の発展的課題として提示されたものである。以上、本論文は、そうした課題を勘案してもなお、申請者の独創的な観点に加えて、具体的・実証的な分析や検証においても、当該分野に一石を投じ得る、十分な価値を有しており、審査委員会は、全員一致で、本論文を博士の学位を授与するに値するものと判定した。

(備考)

1. 用紙の大きさは、日本工業規格 (JIS) A 4 縦型とする。
2. 1 行あたり 40 文字 (英文の場合は 80 文字)、1 ページ当たり 40 行で作成する。
3. 上マージン, 下マージン, 右マージンは 2 cm, 左マージンは 2.5 cm とする。
4. タイトルと本文の間は、1 行空ける。
5. ページ番号は入れない。
6. 出願者 (申請者) が論文審査に合格し、博士号が授与された場合は、本紙を総合研究大学院大学リポジトリにおいて、インターネット公開する。

Note:

1. The sheets must be Japanese Industrial Standard (JIS) A4 vertical.
2. Each line shall have approximately 40 characters in Japanese or 80 characters in English, and each page shall have 40 lines.
3. The top, bottom, and right margins must be 2 cm and the left one must be 2.5 cm.
4. Single spacing is required between the title and the text.
5. There must be no page numbers.
6. If the applicant is conferred a doctoral degree, this paper will be published on the SOKENDAI Repository.